

**LAYTON CITY PLANNING COMMISSION WORK MEETING MINUTES
OCTOBER 28, 2014**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Dawn Fitzpatrick, Gerald Gilbert, Wynn Hansen, Brett Nilsson, Randy Pulham, Robert Van Drunen, Dave Weaver, L.T. Weese

MEMBERS ABSENT: Brian Bodily

OTHERS PRESENT: Staff Members: Bill Wright, Peter Matson, Kem Weaver, Tyson Willis, Julie Matthews

City Council: Mayor Bob Stevenson, Council Members Tom Day and Joy Petro

PUBLIC REVIEW:

1. WINCO FOODS – CONDITIONAL USE FOR BIG BOX RETAIL OVER 80,000 SQUARE FEET

This property is located at approximately 200 South Fort Lane in a CP-2 (Planned Community Commercial) zoning district. The applicant is WinCo Foods represented by Tristan Van Slyke.

Planner II, Kem Weaver, explained that when WinCo initially applied for and received conditional use approval in 2010, they were doing due diligence on the project but were not ready to go forward with site development. He said they demolished the old strip mall in the Fort Lane Subdivision and received a conditional use permit extension in October 2011. The same conditions applied to the extension as the original with an additional condition to move the huge dirt pile.

Mr. Weaver said recently WinCo has come back and re-evaluated the site. The economy has improved. Through their extensive research, marketing and due to financial ability, they have decided to move forward with the development and again are requesting a conditional use permit. Only the conditional use request will be reviewed at this meeting. There is a development plan that will go to the City Council for approval on November 6, 2014, per the development agreement of the Fort Lane Village Commercial Subdivision.

Mr. Weaver said this use comes before the Planning Commission for conditional use because of the size of the building. Typically a retail type land use is permitted in a CP-2 zone, but there is also a provision in the ordinance that anything over 80,000 square feet in building size has to come before the Planning Commission for conditional use approval.

Mr. Weaver explained how the parking design had changed. There will be an additional pad for future development along the I-15 corridor that will be split from the original WinCo lot.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked for an explanation of the placement of parking. Community & Economic Development Director, Bill Wright, said there were a lot of cross access easements. The size of the store has been reduced. Mr. Wright said the parking for the remainder of the development would be determined in the development plan. He explained the portion of the site WinCo doesn't own, which are the future development pads.

Commissioner Hansen asked who would maintain the future development sites. Mr. Weaver said WinCo would use a compound that keeps dust and dirt and weeds down.

Mayor Stevenson said that once the WinCo Store begins construction, hopefully there will be some good tenants that want to come in to the future development pads.

Commissioner Hansen asked where the 10,000 square foot downsize of the building would be. Mr. Weaver said the building previously went further west.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked about the truck traffic flow. Mr. Wright said it would not come across the front of the store. It would exit on the south side and go back on the Interstate.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked that WinCo not allow semi truck parking due to the noise issue, especially the refrigerated units. Commissioner Hansen said that no truck parking should be allowed on the entire site.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked if there would be curb, gutter and sidewalk on the road from WinCo to Wasatch Drive particularly so people could come from the City Park to the shopping area. He said it would be important to keep pedestrians off the road, especially if it is a walkable community.

Mr. Weaver and Mr. Wright said that future development along the access road would put in sidewalk.

There was a discussion regarding sidewalk by Zion's Bank and also the old Zion's Bank building and the animal clinic that had planned to operate out of that building.

The WinCo architect, Byron Hills, who was present at the meeting, said code requires an accessible pedestrian way to the store. He said there would always be an accessible route to the public right of way. He said the curved access road would have a concrete curb and gutter for now and sidewalk would be added with future development.

Commissioner Van Drunen said that a walkable development shouldn't just mean to walk from your car. There is residential property around this development and access should be made easy to encourage people to walk.

There was a discussion regarding the future of the Gentile Street and Fort Lane intersection including the widening of Gentile Street and the inclusion of additional lanes.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked about the signage for the development and parking lot lights. Mr. Weaver said there would be planned development signage. Mr. Matson said the height limit would be 20 feet. Mr. Weaver said the parking lot lights would be no more than 18 feet high with lighting directed away from Fort Lane and the residential areas.

Commissioner Weaver asked about the Design Review Committee (DRC) recommendations. Mr. Weaver said ultimately the Planning Commission can accept recommendations from the DRC.

The building elevations were reviewed and there was a discussion regarding the cornice on the building. Commissioner Hansen said the current elevations were different from the original elevations. He felt they didn't approach the quality of the prior design and the store built in Roy.

Chairman Gilbert said he felt the WinCo store was an opportunity for the area. He felt it was important not to make the elevations a deal breaker.

Commissioner Hansen felt the previous elevations were the high end and the proposal was the low end. He hoped there could be room for WinCo and the City to find something in between.

Chairman Gilbert asked if Staff had had any conversations with WinCo regarding the elevations.

Mr. Wright said that the President of WinCo had become concerned that all of the stores were being built with a different design and the company was looking for a standard of architecture. The proposed is what WinCo has decided on for their corporate architecture.

He said the purpose of the conditional use is because the building is over 80,000 square feet. The proposed design and corporate image break the elevation into pieces so that the building is not just a large wall. He explained the canopy and other definitions of the elevations. He said Staff asked WinCo to add the darker brown columns on the east side so there appeared to be smaller sections.

Mr. Wright said WinCo proposed this design and it is an image they want to establish as their corporate scheme. Staff's position is that there will be a greater impact on getting this anchor store on the ground so that fringe properties can be marketable and viable. Once these fringe properties are developed, there won't be much view shed to the WinCo property. He said WinCo has accomplished what they were asked in terms of architectural breaks.

Commissioner Weaver asked what the DRC comments were on the design. Mr. Wright said the DRC recognized that the design makes an effort to bring the plane forward and backward and incorporate some height changes in the roof over the canopy. The DRC didn't debate on how they would change the design because it was not their job. They asked that the top of the cornices not be too flat, and WinCo agreed. Mr. Wright said the entry feature from the 2010 design has changed from a plastic curtain with garage doors to window glazed doors. WinCo enhanced the entry area of the building, which is better than the 2010 design.

Chairman Gilbert said it seemed the Commission was more concerned with looking at what was originally proposed than what it is today. He said the back portion is going to be more noticeable. He mentioned the landscaping with the detention pond. The future property to the east will hide some of the WinCo store. He said he hoped the Planning Commission would have input on the design on the future properties on the site.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked if the City's view had changed from an upscale area. Mr. Wright said the development agreement will guide the development plans. He said the proposal doesn't change much of what was approved before except the big box being 10,000 square feet less in size.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked if the look and feel of the center changed since he remembered plans for walkability and upscale stores.

Mr. Wright said that was still in the development agreement, but the anchor store needs to be developed first.

Mr. Hills said the main building is concrete masonry block like the Smith's stores. The cornice will be masonry block and built in rather than an add on. He described the canopy and different textures on the face of the building, which he said were the same as proposed in 2010.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick felt rock along the columns would help enhance the building and blend the architecture in with the Zion's Bank building.

Commissioner Weese asked if the proposed was just the model for Utah. Mr. Hills said it was the criteria of design wherever WinCo builds.

Commissioner Hansen said it was exciting the store is moving forward but felt it would give Layton a nicer look if there was something in between than what was proposed.

Mayor Stevenson said it is not considered a low end or high end. It's WinCo's corporate view. Staff has been talking with WinCo for over a year. There is no question that input is important, but it has been over many meetings and discussions to come to this point. Having WinCo come to the City at this time will not only help that area, but surrounding areas. What we've seen is that the facility they are bringing in is more than adequate for what we are looking for. We want this to be a very, very nice area. The WinCo store is the key to make the whole thing work.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked what would happen if the corporate philosophy of the junior anchor is lower. She felt it wouldn't cost a lot of money for the rock face.

Mayor Stevenson reminded the Commission that a lot of money is already being spent.

Mr. Wright said some architects would tell you that the stacked rock looks like an appliqué. He explained that what is designed gives some relief. He said it is difficult to design a building by a committee of people who aren't architects, and that is why the DRC didn't try to design the building.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked if the detention pond had to have grass or could it have rocks in the bottom.

Mr. Weaver said it will be natural seed mix that would need to be mowed once a summer. He said there would be sod on the freeway side and pointed out that a row of shrubs will be moved to create a more open view at the west of the building.

Commissioner Weese said in another development around a WalMart, once all the other parcels were developed, it looked amazing. He said he was concerned about a disputation over a rock wall on a multi-million dollar development. He would rather have the WinCo store than the diesel trucks and the taco stand.

Commissioner Van Drunen asked again if the philosophy of the development had changed and would the development be a big box with strip malls and a sea of asphalt.

Mayor Stevenson said that we would hope that as time goes, the north side of Gentile would tie in with the development.

Commissioner Pulham asked about the traffic flow.

Mayor Stevenson said Staff has been working with Garn the Group, UDOT and WinCo with regard to the traffic flow.

Mr. Wright explained that when a plan comes in, the City can exact what needs to occur to the frontage of a road that is related to the development. When the subdivision was approved in 2010, there was a widening that had to occur for a right turn off Gentile. He explained the improvements that would be required and said the transportation master plan indicated five lanes would be needed. An additional 26 feet of roadway had been identified and Staff is working with the Utah Department of Transportation to preserve that area. The area will be preserved before there are buildings and the north side of the development will ultimately be a five lane section to Gentile.

Mayor Stevenson said the parking lot was massive before. As it builds out and there are more buildings, it will feel more like a walkable area. The Garn group has been trying to make that happen.

Mr. Wright said in the 2010 design, WinCo proposed 515 parking stalls. The current proposal is for 340 stalls. This is due to a philosophical change on their part.

The entry areas and roadway to be widened when WinCo develops were discussed.

2. SHAWN STRONG – ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

This property is located at 2563 West Gordon Avenue in an R-2 (Single and Two Family Residential) zoning district. The applicant, Shawn Strong, is proposing two twin homes.

This item was not discussed due to lack of time.



Julie K. Matthews, Planning Commission Secretary

**LAYTON CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
OCTOBER 28, 2014**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Dawn Fitzpatrick, Gerald Gilbert, Wynn Hansen, Brett Nilsson, Randy Pulham, Robert Van Drunen, Dave Weaver, L.T. Weese

MEMBERS ABSENT: Brian Bodily

OTHERS PRESENT: Staff Members: Bill Wright, Peter Matson, Kem Weaver, Tyson Willis, Julie Matthews

City Council Members: Mayor Bob Stevenson, Council Members Tom Day and Joy Petro

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE AND INVOCATION

Chairman Gilbert called the meeting to order at 7:10 p.m. The Pledge of Allegiance was recited and an invocation given by Commissioner Fitzpatrick.

A Scout Troop from the Layton 7th LDS Ward was introduced. They were at the meeting to meet the requirements for their Citizenship in the Community Merit Badge.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

Chairman Gilbert called for a motion to approve the September 23, 2014, meeting minutes. There were no corrections to the minutes. Commissioner Fitzpatrick moved to approve the minutes as written. Commissioner Van Drunen seconded the motion, and the voting was unanimous.

Chairman Gilbert called for a motion to open Public Review. Commissioner Weaver moved to open Public Review. Commissioner Hansen seconded the motion, and the voting was unanimous.

PUBLIC REVIEW:

1. WINCO FOODS– CONDITIONAL USE FOR BIG BOX RETAIL OVER 80,000 SQUARE FEET

This property is located at approximately 200 South Fort Lane in a CP-2 (Planned Community Commercial) zoning district. The applicant is WinCo Foods represented by Tristan Van Slyke.

Kem Weaver, Planner II, presented the request for conditional use. He reviewed the background since the original conditional use was granted by the Planning Commission in October of 2010. At that time, the size was going to be about 94,000 square feet. Traditionally in a CP-2 zone, retail type uses are permitted. Because the store is over 80,000 square feet, the Planning Commission has the opportunity to review the request and grant conditional use approval.

There was no development on the site following the October 2010 conditional use approval. WinCo asked for a six-month extension in October 2011. Since there was no work on the site during the extension period, the conditional use expired in April, 2012.

Mr. Weaver said that in the past year, Staff has been working with WinCo, and they made the decision to construct a store in Layton.

Mr. Weaver said utilities are a big ticket item on this project. WinCo has to bring a new private road from Gentile Street into the development and to the lot for WinCo. This will line up with Wasatch Drive and become a 4-way intersection. Utilities will come through that road and loop through the development. That work needs to be done along with the development of the store. Staff has worked with WinCo on the installation of the utilities.

Since the original conditional use approval, a future parcel has been split from the WinCo parcel between the parking lot and the I-15 corridor, and parking for the WinCo store was reduced from 515 to 340 parking spaces.

Mr. Weaver said the architecture of the building meets ordinance and development agreement requirements. The building will be of earth tone colors and be of block masonry materials. The main entrance of the building is offset from the center of the building. The entrance is shifted forward from the face of the building with matching columns. The roofline changes in height in sections and crescendos at the entrance of the store. The front façade is broken up with the entrance of the building and the corrugated metal canopy to the right of the entrance, which shelters the exterior storage of carts for the store.

Mr. Weaver said the loading dock and trash compactor/dumpster area will be screened by an eight-foot block masonry wall that matches the main building. A smaller secondary dock will be screened by a six-foot fence with interlocking slats.

Mr. Weaver said the DRC had the following recommendation to the Planning Commissioners.

- Use a pronounced cornice on the front of the store, not necessarily the full width, but at least on both sides of the main entry.

With regard to landscaping, Mr. Weaver said the attached colored landscape plan incorporates significant areas to be landscaped and irrigated. At the entrance of the subdivision from Gentile Street and Wasatch Drive there is a landscaped island planned with trees and shrubs.

Mr. Weaver said the WinCo Foods parking area will have landscaped islands on the north and south end of the parking area. Trees and shrubs will be located within these landscaped islands. Landscaped diamonds will be spaced through the parking area and down each parking aisle; these diamonds will be occupied by a tree. A species of tall shrubs will be planted along the west property line to screen the I-15 corridor. The detention pond will have Kentucky blue grass on the berms and a native grass seed mix at the base of the pond.

He said the future development pads will be left un-landscaped and sprayed with a compound that arrests dust and constrains weed growth.

Mr. Weaver said the DRC had a few recommendations for the Planning Commission to consider.

- Change out the coniferous species by removing the Bristle Cone Pine trees and planting a taller species of Colorado Spruce.
- Due to the mature size of the Pfitzer Juniper drowning out the adjacent trees and shrubs, a recommendation was made to plant the Buffalo Juniper specie to create more open spaces.
- Reposition the 6-foot shrubs from the adjacent drive aisle to the west property line, adjacent to the I-15 corridor.

Mr. Weaver said, with regard to parking, that City ordinance requires one parking space for every 200 square feet of occupied floor space. A gross total of parking for 85,125 square feet of floor space would equate to 426 parking spaces. A net total (which removes restrooms, docking areas and storage warehousing) would typically be a 20% reduction in floor area and would equate to 68,100 square feet or 340 parking spaces.

He said the site plan proposes 394 parking spaces, and 54 of the 394 spaces will be used for the junior anchor building when it is constructed. This will leave 340 parking spaces for WinCo Foods, which meets the parking ordinance requirement.

Mr. Weaver said there are minor corrections that need to be made and resubmitted on the site plan. He said Staff recommends the Planning Commission approve the conditional use request with the following conditions:

1. The parking lot and building lighting for WinCo shall be designed to keep light from leaking onto adjacent properties and causing a negative impact for both residents and traffic on I-15.
2. The design of the building and landscaping of the site shall adhere to all the Design Review Committee recommendations as listed in this memo.
3. Any external HVAC equipment shall be screened from public view.

Mr. Weaver said a Condition # 4, which will be added at the request of the Commission, is that no semi-truck parking is allowed on the site.

Mr. Weaver said that on the record for the minutes, the City has received a couple of comments from citizens (Dawn Harvey and Jana Cannon) who are whole heartedly in favor of the WinCo store.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked if the orange triangles on the drawing were cart storage, and Mr. Weaver replied in the affirmative.

Chairman Gilbert asked the WinCo representative, Greg Owens, Vice-President of Real Estate for WinCo, if he had reviewed the conditions and understood and agreed with them and the addition of the fourth condition. Mr. Owens said he agreed with the conditions. He said WinCo trucks absolutely do not park in the parking lot. The diesel truck parking is a problem they expect to go away. He expressed appreciation to the Commission for reviewing their request.

Mr. Owens said WinCo wanted to bring the project back to Layton within a cost structure. He said one of the things they've done to reduce costs is to reduce the size of the building. The other large area of cost reduction came in the elevation of the stores. Over the years, the stores got so they were extremely expensive. He said they saved about \$1,000,000 on the elevations but that allowed them to build where they previously could not. He said WinCo wants to maintain a particular corporate image.

Commissioner Weaver asked about delivery hours. He said larger trucks and direct vendors come at 4:30 or 5:00 a.m. He said from a noise perspective there shouldn't be a problem. Trucks are in and out before noon.

Commissioner Nilsson asked if there was a projected timeline for the project.

Mr. Owens said WinCo was ready to immediately go forward. He said the City has indulged them during the recession. A number of projects were put on hold due to housing growth that stopped. WinCo bought the property with the intent of one day building a store, and they are ready to build assuming they are in agreement with the City on design. They are hoping to start next month and open before Thanksgiving 2015.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked how many people the store would hire. Mr. Owens said 120 people from the local municipality.

Commissioner Weaver asked the store hours, and Mr. Owens said they would be open 24 hours

There were no further comments from the Commission and no comments from the audience.

Chairman Gilbert said he had been looking forward to this project and has been involved with it since the beginning. He expressed confidence that support in the investment from the public will be there for WinCo. He recognized there were concerns with the design, but from his point of view, with the overall development and additional tenants, it will be a positive development for the City.

Chairman Gilbert called for a motion on the item.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick moved that the Planning Commission approve the conditional use with the Staff recommendation of the three conditions as well as the fourth condition of posting that there should be no semi-truck parking at that location being hereby adopted as requirements. Commissioner Nilsson seconded the motion, and the voting was unanimous.

2. SHAWN STRONG – ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW

This property is located at 2563 West Gordon Avenue in an R-2 (Single and Two Family Residential) zoning district. The applicant, Shawn Strong, is proposing two twin homes.

Kem Weaver presented the request for architectural review approval. He said Mr. Strong is proposing to develop property at 2563 West Gordon Avenue. This property was rezoned approximately four years ago. Because Gordon Avenue is an arterial street, low to medium density is allowed. In August 2013, single story twin homes were approved for this property by the Planning Commission. That developer has decided not to develop the property. The owner is Dustin Siddoway and the potential buyer is Shawn Strong. The development agreement with the rezone required an architectural review. The proposed plan closely matches the development agreement.

Mr. Weaver said the applicant is proposing a housing product that closely relates to the original architectural designs of the original property owner. This reversion back to the original architecture and mass of the twin homes closely matches the Development Agreement requirements. Section 4.6 of the development agreement states that garage doors shall not exceed 60% of the linear frontage of each dwelling unit. The garage door meets this requirement by having only 53.5% of the lineal frontage of the unit being the garage door.

- The original concept of the twin homes showed a building that was two-stories. The new proposal from the applicant reverts back to the original concept of the twin homes as addressed by the Development Agreement
- The same type of building materials would match existing homes in the area. The roof pitches will also match existing homes in the area.
- The side of the twin homes will face Gordon Avenue with window treatments and masonry materials. The front door will not be seen from the public street.

- The garages will accommodate two cars. Each unit will be able to park three vehicles, which meets the parking ordinance.

Mr. Weaver said the site plan indicates four visitor parking spaces.

Mr. Weaver said all other sections of the owners undertakings in the development agreement would need to be met. He said that 40 percent landscaping is required and this plan has 57 percent landscaping.

Based on this information, Mr. Weaver said Staff recommends the Planning Commission approve the architectural review request.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked if this had been before the Planning Commission an additional time. Mr. Weaver said the first proposal was for two two-story twin homes. Mostly recently there was a proposal for single story twin homes.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick also asked if each home would have their own trash. Mr. Weaver replied in the affirmative.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked about fencing, and Mr. Weaver said there would be vinyl fencing on three sides of a tan color per the development agreement.

Commissioner Weaver asked about the streetscape, and Mr. Weaver said a nice streetscape out toward Gordon Avenue was planned.

Commissioner Weaver asked if there was a detention basin on the layout. Mr. Weaver said detention would be towards the front of the site and landscaped as well. The detention will be surveyed in and built to Engineering Division requirements.

Commissioner Fitzpatrick asked if there were patios on these units on the back side. Mr. Weaver said that the back of the home goes up to the landscaping.

Commissioner Nilsson said based on density, it almost looks like this particular plan could accommodate a similar size building to the south. He asked if there was any intent for expansion of this property.

Mr. Weaver said the development agreement only allows for four total units.

Commissioner Nilsson asked if the units are intended to be for sale or for rent. The developer, Shawn Strong, said they would be for rent.

Chairman Gilbert asked if the units were close enough to Gordon Avenue to not require any special sprinkling system. Mr. Weaver said they are within 150 feet of the public right of way and are not required to have a fire suppression system.

Commissioner Gilbert asked if there was enough room to park in front of the garage doors. Mr. Weaver said the cars may encroach on the drive aisle if they park in front of the garage doors.

There were no questions for the developer and no questions from the public.

Chairman Gilbert called for a motion on the item

Commissioner Weaver moved that the Planning Commission approve the architectural review per the development agreement. Commissioner Fitzpatrick seconded the motion, and the voting was unanimous.

Chairman Gilbert called for a motion to close the Public Review. Commissioner Van Drunnen moved to close the Public Review. Commissioner Hansen seconded the motion, and the voting was unanimous.

The meeting adjourned at 7:44 p.m.



Julie K. Matthews, Planning Commission Secretary